Understanding Building Conservation

Professor John Edwards  MA, DipBldgCons, CEnv, FRICS, FCIOB, IHBC

CIOB Certified Building Conservation Specialist (Building Surveyor Practitioner)
RICS Certified Historic Building Professional
Accredited by the Institute for Historic Building Conservation

Director: Edwards Hart Consultants

ciobacademy.org
Significance and Philosophy
Sessions

1. Introduction
2. Significance and Philosophy
3. Technical Analysis
5. Interventions
6. Specifying, Managing and Implementing
Session Two

- History of conservation
- Guiding lights and philosophy – international charters, guidance and standards
- Significance and its assessment
- Heritage management – conservation management plans, statements of significance and heritage impact assessments
- Conservation strategy
- Listed buildings and scheduled monuments
- Building regulations and standards
“The idea that there can be alternative philosophical approaches to the preservation of buildings is seriously misleading. Correctness cannot be watered down. You should either do a job properly or not do it at all”. **PURIST**

“A sound philosophy is one which points in the right general direction – that of truthfulness. Its precise application must depend on the building and its circumstances. If I am in command of all the facts, then the building itself will tell me what to do”. **PRAGMATIST**

“Preservation is a completely artificial procedure, interfering with the natural processes of decay and obsolescence. Preservation philosophies are therefore necessarily artificial. They are generally used to justify and approach already decided upon”. **CYNIC**
This is Conservation

**SIGNIFICANCE**
- Significance analysis
- Conservation Plans (and Conservation Management Plans)
- Heritage Impact Assessments

**TECHNICAL**
- Surveys (Condition, Quinquennial, etc.)
- Inspections
- Targeted Specialist Investigations

**PROCESS**
- Project management, Heritage Management & Supervision
- Maintenance management & FM
How Conservation Has Developed

- 1818: Grand Duchy of Hesse new laws to protect monuments.
- 1830: France appoints an Inspector of Ancient Monuments.
- 1834: First Greek monuments legislation (reformed/extended 1899)
- 1837: France sets up Commission for Ancient Monuments with an inventory and programme of repair and restoration.
- 1852: French Commission introduces measures for protection of great vista and monumental perfectives.
- 1853: Prussian monuments commission appointed.
- 1887/9: French Historical Monuments Law
How Conservation Has Developed

• 1865: Commons Preservation Society formed
• 1877: SPAB (Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings) formed
• 1882: First British Ancient Monuments Act
• 1895: National Trust founded
• 1900: Ancient Monuments Protection act
• 1924: Ancient Monuments Society founded
• 1931: NTS founded
• 1932: Town & Country Planning Act introduces ‘building preservation orders’
• 1957: Civic Trust founded
• 1975: Save Britain’s Heritage founded
Why Conservation Has Developed

- The Cambridge Camden Society (formed 1839) & Oxford Movement – massive programme of church restoration nearly 80% in England and Wales between 1840 and 1875
- Opposition – John Ruskin – art critic. in 1849 he wrote in ‘The Seven Lamps of Architecture’ that it was not possible "to restore anything that has ever been great or beautiful in architecture". His attitude influenced the Society of Antiquaries of London, which urged in 1855 that "no restoration should ever be attempted, otherwise than ... in the sense of preservation from further injuries"
Why Conservation Has Developed

- "Protection in place of Restoration".

William Morris
Why Conservation Has Developed

Bath Abbey:

Stone vault replaced earlier timber roof structure
Why Conservation Has Developed

Before

After
Why Conservation Has Developed

But of late years a great uprising of ecclesiastical zeal, coinciding with a great increase of study, and consequently of knowledge of medieval architecture has driven people into spending their money on these buildings, not merely with the purpose of repairing them, of keeping them safe, clean, and wind and watertight, but also of "restoring" them to some ideal state of perfection; sweeping away if possible all signs of what has befallen them at least since the Reformation, and often since dates much earlier.

William Morris in 1877
The meaning of Conservation

Many definitions

Australian Burra Charter

“Conservation means all the processes of looking after a place so as to retain its cultural significance.....”

Significance means: “aesthetic, historic, scientific or spiritual value for the past, present and future generations.”

Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter 1999.
The meaning of Conservation

*Is changing...*

- Not just fabric
- A broader range of values as well
- Significance
- Promotion of Heritage Management
The meaning of Conservation

SPAB (Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings)

Philosophy

THE SPAB APPROACH
to the conservation & care of old buildings

MATTHEW SLOCOMBE
The meaning of Conservation

SPAB (Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings) Philosophy

In practice this means:

• **Respect for age and character** – physical evidence.
• **Minimum intervention** – only doing enough to execute a repair and no more.
• **New work subservient to old** – physically & aesthetically
• **Honest repairs** – letting the repair be seen and not attempting to hide or disguise – sometimes highlighting the repair.
• **Repairs should not preclude later repairs** – when necessary
Cultural Significance

Australian Burra Charter

“Conservation means all the processes of looking after a place so as to retain its cultural significance.....”

Significance means: “aesthetic, historic, scientific or spiritual value for the past, present and future generations.”

Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter 1999.

ciobacademy.org
Cultural Significance

WHAT’S THE DIFFERENCE & DOES IT MATTER?
• Similar design
• Similar Construction
• Similar performance
• Requires Similar Repairs
• Same understanding!

Cultural Significance – is the difference!
Authoritative Guidance

BS 7913: 1998

Following traditional practice of conservation

– not based on managing significance
Authoritative Guidance

RICS: 2008

–based on managing significance
Authoritative Guidance

English Heritage Conservation Principles: 2008

–based on managing significance
Cadw Conservation Principles: 2011

–based on managing significance
Authoritative Guidance

BS 7913: 2013

—based on managing significance

Guidance with whole industry mainstream appeal
EXERCISE

1. Description of buildings/Architecture & conservation history.
2. Significance, conservation principles and values.
3. Heritage management – pro-active & re-active – reconciling values
4. Historic areas as well as structures / buildings.
5. Condition surveys, inspections, investigations and pathology
8. New development & adaptation.
9. Maintenance
10. Sustainability and energy efficiency.
11. Project Management.
12. Project Supervision
13. Competence & Accreditation
Contents

0. Introduction

1. Scope

2. Normative References

3. Terms and definitions

4. Heritage Values and Significance
   Use of significance, Values contributing to significance, Assessment of significance.

5. Using Significance as a framework for managing the historic environment
6. Significance as part of operational care and other interventions
Asset Management, Condition surveys and inspections, Assessment of performance and pathology, Investigation techniques and equipment, common defects and approaches to assessment, Fire strategy, Repair, Lost features, Damp and fungi, Intervention and judgment, Environmental values and sustainability, New development, Design, Context and setting, Adaptation, conversion and extension, Alterations.

7. Maintenance

8. Heritage and Project Management – with Project Supervision

Annexe A – Conservation Accreditation Schemes

Annexe B – Conservation Manuals, Logbooks and periodic inspections
“The decision to conserve buildings can be justified on social, cultural, economic and/or environmental grounds, and usually a combination of these. Conflicting pressures often need to be balanced to assist good decision making. Good conservation depends on a sound research evidence base and the use of competent advisors and contractors.

BS 7913: 2013 "Introduction"
4.1 Use of significance in the management of the historic Environment

“Significance represents a public interest...”

“Research and appraisal into the heritage values and significance of the historic building should be carried out to ensure that decisions resulting in change are informed by a thorough understanding of them”. This is proportionate.

“Understanding the significance of a historic building enables effective decision...”
Values contributing to significance

“Heritage has cultural, social, economic and environmental values. The attributes that combine to define the significance of a historic building can relate to its physical properties or to its context”

So SIGNIFICANCE can be a very broad value and it MUST be UNDERSTOOD
Cultural Significance

Is this what we call Significant?
Cultural Significance

*Is this what we call Significant?*
Attributes of Significance

BS 7913: 2013: 4.2 Values contributing to significance

Heritage values assessed into groups:

a) **aesthetic value** - ways in which people draw sensory and intellectual stimulation from a place;

b) **communal value**, - the meanings of a place for people who relate to it in different ways, associations with social groups and individuals;

c) **evidential value** - potential of a place to yield evidence about the past (e.g. archaeology); and

d) **historical value** - ability of a place to demonstrate or illustrate an aspect of the past or association with historic figure or event.
### Attributes of Significance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual heritage values:</th>
<th>1) architectural, technological or built fabric value;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2) townscape characteristics;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) spatial characteristics;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) archaeological value;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) artistic value;</td>
<td>12) spiritual value;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) economic value;</td>
<td>13) ecological value;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) educational value;</td>
<td>14) environmental value;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8) recreational value;</td>
<td>15) commemorative value;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9) social or communal value;</td>
<td>16) inspirational value;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10) cultural value;</td>
<td>17) identity or belonging;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11) religious value;</td>
<td>18) national pride;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19) symbolic or iconic value;</td>
<td>20) associational value;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20) associational value;</td>
<td>21) panoramic value;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21) panoramic value;</td>
<td>22) scenic value;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22) scenic value;</td>
<td>23) aesthetic value;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23) aesthetic value;</td>
<td>24) material value; and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24) material value; and</td>
<td>25) technological value</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The assessment of significance

A wide range of factors contribute to significance and their relative importance varies:

- **Physical components,**
- **Immediate and wider setting,**
- **Use and associations** (e.g. with a particular event, family, community, or artist and those involved in design and construction).
Assessment of Significance

BS 7913: 2013: 4.3 The assessment of significance

Examples of the characteristics that can be taken into account when assessing significance are:

a) attributes relating to the physical and spatial properties (aesthetic, historic and evidential value):
   1) the original design of the historic building and how it has changed over time, including material patina;
   2) the materials used in construction; and
   3) the presence of archaeological information in remains above and below ground (evidential value);
Assessment of Significance

Attributes relating to the physical and spatial properties (aesthetic, historic and evidential value):

Original design, how it has changed, materials and archaeological information

Cardiff Castle Historical Development
b) characteristics relating to the context of the building;

1) how a building relates to its surroundings (e.g. other buildings, townscape or the wider environment); and

2) how a building relates to similar buildings;
c) characteristics relating to wider associations –
(communal value/associative value):

1) the use of the historic building over time and its connections with a significant person, family or community;
2) associations with historical, scientific or artistic events or works (e.g. literature, paintings); and
3) social significance, and the historical, cultural, economic, political and social factors that influenced the design.
Using Significance in Making Decisions

BS 7913: 2013: Section 4.4 Understanding heritage assets, historic buildings, values and significance

Significance should be properly understood and taken into account when making decisions.
Components: Historical Significance

Historical significance possible sources: on a non-exhaustive list basis.

- Primary sources: Mostly physical. The building itself and its associated original archival records.

- Secondary sources: Mostly documentary. May be local, national or international
Components: Historical Significance

Secondary Sources - Local

- Local authority records. Sites and Monuments Records and Historic Environment Records
- Local reference and history library
- Local history web sites and building/site focused web sites
- Local records office
- Local history museum
- Archaeological studies and reports
- Local archaeological societies or bodies
- Local listing documents, statutory lists
Secondary Sources – Local (continued)

- Diocesan records
- Quinquennial reviews
- Local newspaper archive libraries
- Local authority records, especially planning and building control
Secondary - National Sources

- Site and Monument Records (SMR)
- Historic Environment Records (HER)
- ‘Pevsner’ guides
- Research theses and dissertations
- Historic England, Historic Environment Scotland, Cadw and Northern Ireland Government Heritage Division
- Ancient and Historic Monuments of Scotland
- Geographical, geological or regional surveys
- Photographs, prints, or other art work
- Historical Manuscripts Commission
- Ordnance Survey
Primary sources

Mostly emotional and spiritual and, possibly subjective.

The building itself and associated archival records, particularly how the public perceive the building; the uses to which they put the building – local lay perception of why the building is important – the need for public consultation as to why the building is important.
Secondary sources

Mostly documentary and may be local, national or international:

• Local records office
• Parish records
• Local historians and societies
• Local history library
• Local authority records
• Local newspaper archive library
• Local reference library
• Research theses and dissertations
• Folk music, folklore, oral history, literature, etc.
1. The qualities of architectural or aesthetic value may be altered by intervention and thus, a clear understanding of value must be established prior to intervention.

2. The evaluation of importance must be made in the absence of subjective or conjectural response. This is particularly relevant in respect of recent structures that, because of the absence of historical effect, may not have established a value that is easily recognised by the lay public (a Listed building can be 10 years old).

3. Important to give credit and establish value for all periods of interventions.

4. It might be wrong to assume that any intervention post the original design is of lesser or greater value than the original.
5. Buildings created: satisfy a societal need, commemorate an event, make a statement of importance and express an artistic or developmental period in history (not necessarily recognised at the time).

6. Some buildings over time become structures of local, national or international importance.

7. Their architectural or aesthetic significance may have been established when they were built or developed as a result of society’s evaluation over time.

8. May have been created by a famous architect and be looked on as an example of his/her work.

9. The structure may have gathered layers of significance over time; these additional layers being authentic of their period of introduction.
Conservation Philosophy

*Guiding lights...*

- National and International
- Reaction in legislation and national guidance
- Individual projects
“These old buildings do not belong to us only...they have belonged to our forefathers and they will belong to our descendants unless we play them false. They are not...our property, to do as we like with. We are only trustees for those that come after us.”

William Morris 1889.
The anti-scrape movement culminated in the formation of the Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings and the SPAB Manifesto of 1877.
Until the early/mid 20th century the conservation movement was essentially a British (English even) reaction to the interventionist practices of the Victorian restoration movement.

A similar conflict of philosophies between the interventionists (seeking perfection) and the anti-interventionists was also occurring in France during the 19th century.
Conservation Philosophy

*Guiding lights...*

In practice the SPAB means:

- Respect for age and character
- Minimum intervention
- New work subservient to old
- Honest repairs
- Repairs should not preclude later repairs
Conservation Philosophy

Minimum Intervention – Honest Repairs
INTERNATIONAL CHARTER FOR THE CONSERVATION AND RESTORATION OF MONUMENTS AND SITES (THE VENICE CHARTER 1964)


Adopted by ICOMOS in 1965.
The concept of a historic monument embraces not only the single architectural work but also the urban or rural setting in which is found the evidence of a particular civilization, a significant development or a historic event. This applies not only to great works of art but also to more modest works of the past which have acquired cultural significance with the passing of time.
DEFINITIONS

Article 2.
The conservation and restoration of monuments must have recourse to all the sciences and techniques which can contribute to the study and safeguarding of the architectural heritage.

Article 3.
The intention in conserving and restoring monuments is to safeguard them no less as works of art than as historical evidence.
Venice Charter

CONSERVATION

Article 4.
It is essential to the conservation of monuments that they be maintained on a permanent basis.

Article 5.
The conservation of monuments is always facilitated by making use of them for some socially useful purpose. Such use is therefore desirable but it must not change the lay-out or decoration of the building. It is within these limits only that modifications demanded by a change of function should be envisaged and may be permitted.
Venice Charter

CONSERVATION

Article 6.
The conservation of a monument implies preserving a setting which is not out of scale. **Wherever the traditional setting exists, it must be kept.** No new construction, demolition or modification which would alter the relations of mass and colour must not be allowed.
Venice Charter

CONSERVATION

Article 7.
A monument is inseparable from the history to which it bears witness and from the setting in which it occurs. The moving of all or part of a monument cannot be allowed except where the safeguarding of that monument demands it or where it is justified by national or international interest of paramount importance.

Article 8.
Items of sculpture, painting or decoration which form an integral part of a monument may only be removed from it if this is the sole means of ensuring their preservation.
Venice Charter

RESTORATION
Article 9.
The process of restoration is a highly specialized operation. Its aim is to preserve and reveal the aesthetic and historic value of the monument and is based on respect for original material and authentic documents. **It must stop at the point where conjecture begins, and in this case moreover any extra work which is indispensable must be distinct from the architectural composition and must bear a contemporary stamp.** The restoration in any case must be preceded and followed by an archaeological and historical study of the monument.
Venice Charter

RESTORATION
Article 10.
Where traditional techniques prove inadequate, the consolidation of a monument can be achieved by the use of any modern technique for conservation and construction, the efficacy of which has been shown by scientific data and proved by experience.
RESTORATION

Article 11.

The valid contributions of all periods to the building of a monument must be respected, since unity of style is not the aim of a restoration. When a building includes the superimposed work of different periods, the revealing of the underlying state can only be justified in exceptional circumstances and when what is removed is of little interest and the material which is brought to light is of great historical, archaeological or aesthetic value, and its state of preservation good enough to justify the action. Evaluation of the importance of the elements involved and the decision as to what may be destroyed cannot rest solely on the individual in charge of the work.
Conservation Philosophy

Guiding lights...

Venice Charter

RESTORATION

Article 12.
Replacements of missing parts must integrate harmoniously with the whole, but at the same time must be distinguishable from the original so that restoration does not falsify the artistic or historic evidence.

Article 13.
Additions cannot be allowed except in so far as they do not detract from the interesting parts of the building, its traditional setting, the balance of its composition and its relation with its surroundings.
Venice Charter

HISTORIC SITES
Article 14.
The sites of monuments *must be the object of special care* in order to safeguard their integrity and ensure that they are cleared and presented in a seemly manner. The work of conservation and restoration carried out in such places should be inspired by the principles set forth in the foregoing articles.
Conservation Philosophy

Cardiff Castle Winter Smoking Room

The Venice Charter in Practice

Note area where over painting removed
Conservation Philosophy

The Venice Charter in Practice

RESTORATION
Article 11.
The valid contributions of all periods to the building of a monument must be respected, since unity of style is not the aim of a restoration. When a building includes the superimposed work of different periods, the revealing of the underlying state can only be justified in exceptional circumstances and when what is removed is of little interest and the material which is brought to light is of great historical, archaeological or aesthetic value, and its state of preservation good enough to justify the action. Evaluation of the importance of the elements involved and the decision as to what may be destroyed cannot rest solely on the individual in charge of the work.
Conservation Philosophy

*The Venice Charter in Practice + International Council for Conservation (ICC)*

- Conservation is preservation
- Restoration is in addition to preservation and should only be carried out for compelling reasons
Conservation Philosophy

The Venice Charter in Practice +
International Council for Conservation (ICC) +
UKIC (ICON)

conservation: “...... the means by which the true nature of an object is preserved. The true nature of an object includes evidence of its origins, its original construction, the materials of which it is composed, and information as to the technology used in its manufacture”
Conservation Philosophy

Can we justify removal of overpainting?

- Exceptional circumstances?
- Compelling reasons?
- True Nature understood?

The Venice Charter in Practice
Conservation Philosophy

Guiding lights...

Definitions

**Cultural significance** means: aesthetic, historic, scientific, social or spiritual value for past, present or future generations.

Cultural significance is embodied in the place itself, its fabric, setting, use, associations, meanings, records, related places and related objects.

Places may have a range of values for different individuals or groups.
Definitions

**Fabric** means all the physical material of the place including elements, fixtures, contents and objects
Conservation Philosophy

Guiding lights...

Definitions

Conservation means all the processes of looking after a place so as to retain its cultural significance
**Maintenance** means the continuous protective care of a place, and its setting.

Maintenance is to be distinguished from repair which involves restoration or reconstruction.
Conservation Philosophy

Guiding lights...

Definitions

Preservation means maintaining a place in its existing state and retarding deterioration.

Restoration means returning a place to a known earlier state by removing accretions or by reassembling existing elements without the introduction of new material.

Reconstruction means returning a place to a known earlier state and is distinguished from restoration by the introduction of new material.
Conservation Philosophy

Guiding lights...

Definitions

**Adaptation** means changing a place to suit the existing use or a proposed use.

**Use** means the functions of a place, including the activities and traditional and customary practices that may occur at the place or are dependent on the place.
Conservation Philosophy

Guiding lights...

Burra Charter: Conservation Process

Article 14. Conservation processes

Conservation may, according to circumstance, include the processes of: retention or reintroduction of a use; retention of associations and meanings; maintenance, preservation, restoration, reconstruction, adaptation and interpretation; and will commonly include a combination of more than one of these. Conservation may also include retention of the contribution that related places and related objects make to the cultural significance of a place.
Article 15. Change

Change may be necessary to retain cultural significance, but is undesirable where it reduces cultural significance. The amount of change to a place and its use should be guided by the cultural significance of the place and its appropriate interpretation.

Changes which reduce cultural significance should be reversible, and be reversed when circumstances permit.
Conservation Philosophy

Guiding lights...

Burra Charter: Conservation Process

Article 15. Change

Demolition of significant fabric of a place is generally not acceptable. However, in some cases minor demolition may be appropriate as part of conservation. Removed significant fabric should be reinstated when circumstances permit.

The contributions of all aspects of cultural significance of a place should be respected. If a place includes fabric, uses, associations or meanings of different periods, or different aspects of cultural significance, emphasising or interpreting one period or aspect at the expense of another can only be justified when what is left out, removed or diminished is of slight cultural significance and that which is emphasised or interpreted is of much greater cultural significance.
Conservation Philosophy

If a place includes fabric, of different periods, or different aspects of cultural significance, emphasising or interpreting one period or aspect at the expense of another can only be justified when **what is left out, removed or diminished** is of slight cultural significance and that which is emphasised or interpreted is of much greater cultural significance.

*Cardiff Castle Winter Smoking Room*

*The Burra Charter in Practice*
Alterations should be carried out only if there is no suitable alternative option. They should be designed to minimize their impact on the significance of the historic building, and should avoid losing features that contribute to that significance.

The principle of reversibility should be used, for example, new insertions, such as sub-dividing walls, should be contoured around original features and mouldings so they can be removed in the future, leaving the original fabric intact.
Exercise

Redecoration – list stages and issues
Conservation Philosophy

Cardiff Castle House Basement

BS 7913: 2013: “previous alterations, including an assessment of whether they enhanced or harmed the building’s integrity”
BS 7913: 2013: “previous alterations, including an assessment of whether they enhanced or harmed the building’s integrity”
BS 7913 for avoiding lost features that contribute to significance

21st Century version of the original

Original left but taken out of use
Conservation Strategy

Conservation Based Research & Analysis (CoBRA) activities include:

1. Conservation Plan/Statement/Rapid Assessment
2. Survey and Analysis – covering technical and significance
3. Detailed analysis – can be referred to as a Targeted Specialist Investigation (TSI)
4. Analysis during works, recording, etc.
5. Recording and Archive
Conservation Strategy

SIGNIFICANCE

- Impact assessment
- Reactive

CHANGE

- eg new development
- repair
- alteration

Proactive
- Conservation planning
Conservation Strategy

Starting point – understanding significance....

1. Heritage Analysis – to determine significance values (e.g. conservation management plans, statements of significance)

2. Is this contained in a Conservation Management Plan? If YES also follow Conservation Policies.

3. If not contained in a Conservation Management Plan – then undertake Heritage Impact Assessment

NOTE: Condition surveys and maybe other technical analysis is also necessary
Assessing Significance - Example

Lampeter University – Grade 2* Listed

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE
St David’s College Lampeter - Old Building

April 2016

CONTENT

1.0 General
2.0 Summary
3.0 Introduction
4.0 Methodology
5.0 Description
6.0 Heritage Values
7.0 Heritage Significance
8.0 References
9.0 Appendices

Appendix 1 Listing description
Appendix 2 Maps
Appendix 3 Old Building timeline
Appendix 4 Gazetteer
Appendix 5 Historic photographs and images
Appendix 6 Plans of Significance

10. End Notes
Introducing Heritage Cottage

Setting and Location of case study
Introducing Heritage Cottage
Introducing Heritage Cottage

Existing Ground Floor Plan

Existing First Floor Plan
Introducing Heritage Cottage

EXERCISE

Assessing SIGNIFICANCE within a STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

Evaluate under the following Values:

- Historical
- Aesthetic
- Communal
- Comparative (comparing with others)

Also provide a Conclusion
Conservation Strategy

SIGNIFICANCE
- Significance analysis
- Conservation Plans (and Conservation Management Plans)
- Heritage Impact Assessments

TECHNICAL
- Surveys (Condition, Quinquennial, etc.)
- Inspections
- Targeted Specialist Investigations

PROCESS
- Project management, Heritage Management & Supervision
- Maintenance management & FM

Three elements…
HIA Basic Process

- Understanding significance

- Developing proposals
- **Testing** proposals (Heritage Impact Assessment)
- **Amending** proposals (Heritage Impact Assessment)

**Test:**
- Minimise impact on significance
- Look at the bigger picture and minor detail
Authoritative Guidance

RICS: 2008

–based on managing significance

Includes HIA’s
Paragraph 103: ‘heritage impact assessment’ can be used to compare the predicted effects of alternative courses of action (including taking no action) on the values of a place, in order to identify the optimum solution. The approach can be refined by weighting different values to reflect their relative importance for the place and its significance. Heritage impact assessment can be particularly useful if applied at the conceptual stage of a proposal, and refined at each successive step towards making a decision.
Authoritative Guidance

Cadw Conservation Principles: 2011

–based on managing significance

No specific mention of HIA’s
Authority Guidance

BS 7913: 2013

Based on managing significance

Includes HIA’s
Heritage impact assessments (HIAs)

- Measure impact of proposals on significance and determine mitigation.
- Must understand and articulate the ‘significance’ value.
- “HIAs can be carried out at various levels of scale and complexity, from the effects of building works on a small structure to the effects of major development in a world heritage site”.

BS 7913: 2013: Section 5.9
HIA Process – Significance

Relative Importance - characteristics making up significance:

1. Attributes – spatial & physical properties (aesthetic, historic & evidential):
   a) Original design & how it has changed – including patina.
   b) Materials used.
   c) Survival of archaeological information (evidential)

2. Characteristics relating to the context of the building:
   a) Relating to surroundings – other buildings, townscape, wider environment.
   b) How it relates to what we know about other buildings which are similar, locally and/or nationally.

3. Characteristics relating to wider associations (communal/ associative):
   a) Use over a period of time and connections – significant person, family, community.
   b) Association with historical, scientific or artistic events or works.
   c) Social significance and the historical, cultural, economic, political & social factors that influenced design.

BS 7913: 2013
HIA Process

Impact on significance too great!

Look at the bigger picture ~ sustainability

- Economics
- Space use management ~ options appraisals
- Business Plan of the occupying use
- Specialist reports

Compromising ~ on the basis of knowledge

Finding a sustainable suitable use
HIA Process

Statement of Significance

- Evidential
- Historical
- Aesthetic
- Communal
Heritage Cottage
Proposal to Replace Windows
Undertake a HIA
Issues to consider are:

1. Why?
2. Necessary?
3. Alternatives?
4. Impact on significance?
5. Mitigate impact – if its possible – how?
# HIA Process

## Proposal to Replace Windows at Heritage Cottage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Work</th>
<th>Significance of Fabric Affected</th>
<th>Potential Impact of Work</th>
<th>CoBRA Information</th>
<th>Possible Mitigation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(from specification/drawings)</td>
<td>(explain why fabric is important)</td>
<td>(decide whether the proposals put the fabric at risk)</td>
<td>(information of a technical &amp; significance nature &amp; the process of obtaining it)</td>
<td>(ways of minimising any adverse impact)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Renew windows

**EXERCISE**
## HIA Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zone:</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ref</td>
<td>Proposal &amp; Location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## HIA Process

### Using group values

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proposal</td>
<td>Justification</td>
<td>Significance</td>
<td>Potential Impact of proposal</td>
<td>Activity required to assess Impact</td>
<td>Value Based Judgement</td>
<td>Possible Mitigation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidential</td>
<td>Historical</td>
<td>Aesthetic</td>
<td>Communal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

ciobacademy.org
Managing Significance

SIGNIFICANCE

Impact assessment
Reactive

CHANGE
eg new development
repair
alteration

Conservation planning
Proactive
Managing Significance Pro Actively

BS 7913: 2013: 5.5 Conservation management plans
Also known as conservation plan, heritage management plan, landscape management plan, collections management plan.

Created by:

a) Understand the heritage assets - What historic buildings do we have?

b) Assess and articulate their significance - Why are they important?

c) Define issues, risks and vulnerabilities that may potentially affect that significance - Who are they important to?
d) Establish appropriate conservation management policies to address the issues, risks and vulnerabilities that have been identified - How could the historic buildings and their significance be harmed and any impact mitigated?
Using significance as a framework for managing the historic environment

Strategic and operational management in asset management

“The application of asset management methodologies should be proportionate to the nature and history of the historic building, its ownership, use, the need for any repairs and any proposed works”.
Using significance as a framework for managing the historic environment

BE PROPORTIONATE!
Strategic and operational management in asset management

**Strategic management** overall direction, setting the vision, defining the mission statement, establishing values, goals, targets, planning strategy, delegating responsibilities, etc. viz

a) Where are we now?
b) Where do we want to be?
c) How do we get there?

BS 7913: 2013: Section 5.1:
Conservation Strategy

Strategic and operational management in asset management

• **Day-to-day operational management** - organization and coordination of services and resources to **deliver vision** and strategy

• Operational managers plan and implement change **in line with the strategic direction of the organization**.

• Recognition of **significance** to be central to strategic and operational historic building management.

At both these levels significance should influence decision making.

BS 7913: 2013: Section 5.1:
Conservation Strategy

Significance as part of operational care and other Interventions

Asset management

“When managing historic buildings, significance should be taken into account at every stage from the business strategy of the organization that owns or occupies the historic building to physical work activities”.

BS 7913: 2013: Section 6
Maintenance strategy

• **Significance** to be taken into account when developing the maintenance strategy.

• **Criteria set for level and frequency of inspections and surveys**, recording and monitoring.

• Aim to implement the strategy in a **planned and cost effective** way in meeting standards with methods.

• **Note occupier relationships** where the historic building is in use.

BS 7913: 2013: Section 7.2
Maintenance strategy

• “The details and methods of managing maintenance are largely determined by the .... Strategy”.

• Specify preventative rather than corrective action with minimum intervention, and repair over replacement.

• Some building materials and services have “run to failure” components that cannot be repaired.

• “The means of access to some areas of a historic building can also influence the choice of components and life cycle replacement”.

BS 7913: 2013: Section 7.2
Where a historic building has been altered in the past and is being reinstated to its original form, elements of the historic building which contribute to its design might have been lost and their replacement (or reinstatement) might be justified … Several factors should be taken into account. These include:

a) whether there is evidence of the original design;
b) the quality of alterations relative to the original design;
c) the magnitude of the impact of alterations on significance;
d) retaining alterations as evidence of the building’s history;
e) whether reinstatement would make the historic building more fit for purpose; and
f) archaeological interest/evidential value of a historic building’s development that might be lost.
Reinstatement should be based on strong evidence and research. Where there is insufficient evidence of the original design, conjectural reinstatement should be avoided.

The impact of any reinstatement on significance should be assessed.
Cardiff Castle
Clock Tower
Changing appearance

- Proposal to reinstate original appearance
- Heritage Impact Assessments
- Conservation Policies
- Listed Building Consents
Conservation Strategy

House of Lords Chamber

Palace of Westminster
Conservation Strategy

Cardiff Caste Summer Smoking Room
Conservation Strategy

Foreign and Commonwealth Office

Downing Street West Entrance
Conservation Philosophy

What are you?

“The idea that there can be alternative philosophical approaches to the preservation of buildings is seriously misleading. Correctness cannot be watered down. You should either do a job properly or not do it at all”. **PURIST**

“A sound philosophy is one which points in the right general direction – that of truthfulness. Its precise application must depend on the building and its circumstances. If I am in command of all the facts, then the building itself will tell me what to do”. **PRAGMATIST**

“Preservation is a completely artificial procedure, interfering with the natural processes of decay and obsolescence. Preservation philosophies are therefore necessarily artificial. They are generally used to justify and approach already decided upon”. **CYNIC**
# Ultimate Compliance with...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Primary Legislation</th>
<th>Government Guidance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| England          | *Town & Country Planning Act 1990*  
*Technical Advice Note 24, 2016.*                             |
| Northern Ireland | Planning Act (Northern Ireland) 2011.  
The Planning (Listed Buildings) (Amendment) Regulations (Northern Ireland) 2016 | PPS 6: Planning, Archaeology and The Built Heritage  
Listed Buildings: Policy BH 8                                 |
| Republic of Ireland | Local Government (Planning and Development) Act 2000                                    |                                                          |

Note different legislation for ‘Scheduled Monuments’ in England, Wales & Scotland:  
*Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979. NI & ROI (National Monuments (Amendment) Act 2004)* has different legislation
Scheduled Monuments - UK

What makes Scheduled Monument?

- Period: all.
- Rarity: typical and commonplace as well as the rare.
- Documentation: possible positive impact but not necessary.
- Group Value: the value of a single monument (such as a field system) may be greatly enhanced by its association with related contemporary monuments (such as a settlement and cemetery) or with monuments of different periods.
- Survival / Condition: important – current condition.
- Fragility / Vulnerability: Protection from common activities.
- Diversity: some monuments may be selected for scheduling because they possess a combination of high quality features, others because of a single important attribute.
AGE AND RARITY. The older a building is - fewer the surviving examples of its kind - more likely it is to have special interest. The relevance of age and rarity will vary according to the particular type of building because for some types, dates other than those outlined below are of significance:

• before 1700, all buildings that contain a significant proportion of their original fabric
• from 1700 to 1840, most buildings
• after 1840, because of the greatly increased number of buildings erected and the much larger numbers that have survived, progressively greater selection is necessary;
• after 1945 - careful selection for buildings;
• less than 30 years old - outstanding quality & under threat.
AESTHETIC MERITS. The appearance – including group value – the key consideration, but the special interest of a building will not always be reflected in obvious external visual quality. Buildings that are important for reasons of technological innovation, or as illustrating particular aspects of social or economic history, may have little external visual quality.

SELECTIVITY – Could be listed primarily because it represents a particular historical type in order to ensure that examples of such a type are preserved. Listing in these circumstances is largely a comparative exercise and needs to be selective where a substantial number of buildings of a similar type and quality survive.
NATIONAL INTEREST. Establish consistency of selection to ensure that not only are all buildings of strong intrinsic architectural interest included on the list, but also the most significant or distinctive regional buildings that together make a major contribution to the national historic stock. For instance, the best examples of local vernacular buildings will normally be listed because together they illustrate the importance of distinctive local and regional traditions. Similarly, for example, some buildings will be listed because they represent a nationally important but localised industry, such as shoemaking in Northamptonshire or cotton production in Lancashire.

STATE OF REPAIR. Not a relevant consideration
Protected Buildings – ROI

Selection Criteria – General Principles

Categories of special interest:

a) Architectural;
b) Historical;
c) Archaeological;
d) Artistic;
e) Cultural;
f) Scientific;
g) Technical;
h) Social.
Protected Buildings – ROI

Architectural

a) a generally agreed exemplar of good quality architectural design;
b) the work of a known and distinguished architect, engineer, designer or craftsman;
c) an exemplar of a building type, plan-form, style or styles of any period but also the harmonious interrelationship of differing styles within one structure;
d) a structure which makes a positive contribution to its setting, such as a streetscape or a group of structures in an urban area, or the landscape in a rural area;
e) a structure with an interior that is well designed, rich in decoration, complex or spatially pleasing.
Protected Buildings – ROI

**Historical**

a) Location of an important event that occurred in, or is associated with it, association with a historic personality.

b) A structure may have influenced, or been influenced by, an historic figure. Important people may have lived in the structure or have been otherwise associated with it – for example its patron, designer or builder.

c) A structure may be a memorial to a past event;

d) The design and fabric of the structure may contain evidence of its former use or symbolic or meaning or illustrate a historic development.

e) Rarity, identifiable type were built at a particular time, or few have survived.
Protected Buildings – ROI

**Archaeological**

The degree to which material remains can contribute to our understanding of any period or set of social conditions in the past.

**Artistic**

Special artistic interest may be attributed to a structure itself, or to a part of a structure, for its craftsmanship, design or decoration.
Protected Buildings – ROI

**Cultural**

Include aesthetic, historical, scientific, economic or social values of past and present generations

**Scientific**

Depend on the importance of the data involved and on its rarity and/or quality. Its scientific interest should also be assessed as to how well it represents the area of research in question and the degree to which the structure may contribute further objective information.
Protected Buildings – ROI

**Technical**

Relates to the art of the structural engineer in devising solutions to problems of spanning space and creating weatherproof enclosures. It may be found in structures which are important examples of virtuoso, innovative or unusual engineering design or use of materials.

**Social**

Spiritual, political, symbolic or other sentiment to any group of people. A community may have an attachment to a place because it is an essential reference point for that community’s identity, whether as a meeting place or a place of tradition, ritual or ceremony. May sometimes not be directly related to physical fabric.
Conservation Areas

What work requires consent?

- Demolition of buildings
- Removal of, or work to, trees
- Development involving small house extensions; roof alterations;
- Stone cleaning or painting of the exterior;
- Provision of hard surfaces
- Control over satellite dishes
Applying for consents

The Local Authority & the Conservation Officer

- Defining & updating Conservation Areas
- Maintain local list of buildings of interest
- Advise on applications & provide guidance
- Local plan
- Determine consents
- Monitoring work
- Monitor local buildings at risk
- Enforcement
Government / Advisory Bodies - UK

- Historic England, Cadw, Historic Environment Scotland and Environmental Heritage Service (for Northern Ireland)

- Consulted on listed building applications for grade I & II* listed buildings#

- Receive directly and determine SMC applications

# There are variations on the consultation in Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland. Equivalent categories in Scotland A, B and C and Northern Ireland A, B+ and B
Government / Advisory Bodies - ROI

- Department of Department of Arts, Heritage, Regional, Rural and Gaeltacht Affairs
- Consulted on all applications

- Receive directly and determine National Monument consent applications
ECCLESIASTICAL EXEMPTION

- England and Wales exemption for all denominations* that have an ‘approved system of control’.
- Scotland all exempt
- Northern Ireland all exempt but currently under review
- Republic of Ireland – no exemptions

*Church of England, the Church in Wales, the Roman Catholic Church, the Baptist Union of Great Britain and the Baptist Union of Wales, Methodist Church and the United Reformed Church.
Building Regulations/ Standards

What are they for?

• Standards for design and construction which are apply to most new buildings and many alterations.

• Note – all UK home nations have their own.

• Devolved to Wales – currently nearly all regulations are the same as England. Wales edition of Part L published came into use in 2014 and Part B to follow.

• Building Regulations in the Republic of Ireland have similarities to the UK

• CAUTION – affect on technical performance and character /Significance
Building Regulations/ Standards

Affecting Significance – Character & Technicalities

- Fire
- Disability Access
- Heat & Power / Energy
• All – exempt for Protected/ Listed Buildings and Scheduled /National Monuments – not as definitive in NI

• Unprotected traditional buildings – ALL provide exemption/consideration for protection of character, but who decides?

• Unprotected traditional buildings – SCOTLAND, WALES & ENGLAND exemption where it isn’t technically feasible (ref to vapour permeability).
OUTSTANDING UNIVERSAL VALUE - definition

"Cultural and/or natural significance which is so exceptional as to transcend national boundaries and to be of common importance for present and future generations of all humanity."

Paragraph 49 Operational Guidelines for Implementation of the World Heritage Convention, UNESCO, 2005
UNESCO World Heritage Sites

Forth Bridge, Scotland – Outstanding Universal Value

• When opened in 1890 had the longest bridge span in the world – record for 27 years.
• Distinctive appearance ad iconic.

From 2015
UNESCO World Heritage Sites

Forth Bridge, Scotland – OUV Criteria

• Criterion i): Represents a Masterpiece of Human Creative Genius.

• Criterion ii): Exhibits an Important Interchange of Human Values on Developments in Architecture and Technology

• Criterion iv): An Outstanding Example of a Type of Building, Architectural or Technological Ensemble or Landscape Which Illustrates (a) Significant Stage(s) in Human History
UNESCO World Heritage Sites

Control

• Management Plan.
• Consent.
• Planning Policy.